

Bimodal breeding phenology in the parsley frog *Pelodytes punctatus* as a bet-hedging strategy in an unpredictable environment despite strong priority effects

Helene Jourdan-Pineau, Pierre-Andre Crochet, Patrice David

<https://www.biorxiv.org/content/10.1101/2022.02.24.481784v2> version v2

Submitted by H el ene Jourdan-Pineau 28 Feb 2022 11:53

Round #2

by Gabriele Sorci, 29 Jul 2022 09:24

Manuscript: <https://www.biorxiv.org/content/10.1101/2022.02.24.481784v2> version v2

We could only get one review from the referees who read the first version of the manuscript. As you can see, the referee is very happy with the revision but there are still some typos and minor corrections that have been done. I'll be very pleased to recommend this preprint once these minor corrections are done.

We want to thank Thomas Haaland for this thorough review of our article. We did all the modifications accordingly.

Reviews

Reviewed by Thomas Haaland, 23 Jun 2022 13:17

Thank you for your edits and thorough responses to my previous comments! The revised version is a really nice and clear paper. I now only have some very minor edits, mostly to the new bits of text added.

Line numbers referred to the cleaned manuscript version (i.e., on bioRxiv from 20. June).

Line 23, 111, 418, 425: Don't capitalize "p" in parsley frog. Most places you use get it right, but be consistent.

Thanks for spotting our inconsistent use of capitals when writing Parsley Frog. However, in English, species' common names are written with a capital to the genus and capital to the species. This is true for all animals: see for example doi: 10.1111/ibi.12900 for birds or <https://www.thebhs.org/publications/the-herpetological-bulletin/issue-number-31-spring-1990/2363-hb031-03> for amphibians. So whenever we are referring to *Pelodytes punctatus* by its English name, we must write the Parsley Frog. We have applied this rule consistently throughout the MS.

Line 512: "priority effect is" -> "priority effects are".

Modified

Line 516: Should "of" be changed to "if" or "whether"?

Modified

Line 520: "dye-off" -> "die-off".

Modified to disappearance

Line 522 and 526 both start with "Last,". Maybe the Line 522 one could instead be "Additionally", or "Furthermore". Also, "Lastly" is better than "Last" in this usage.

Modified

Line 530: After "parameters", add comma and "and": "...range of parameters, and these uncertainties..."

Modified

Line 531: "parsley frog" -> "the parsley frog", "parsley frogs", or (if you don't want to generalize that much) "these parsley frogs" or "parsley frogs in southern France"... Also, missing "s": "consitute" -> "consitutes". And missing "a": "bet-hedging strategy" -> "a bet-hedging strategy".

Modified